

# CV-SALTS Executive Committee Meeting

November 17, 2011 9:00 AM to 2:30 PM

Sacramento Regional Sanitation District Offices – Sunset Maple Room  
10060 Goethe Rd, Sacramento 95827

Teleconference (218) 339-4600 Code: 927571#

**Posted 11-7-11 – Revised 11-15-11**

## Meeting Objectives:

- Determine priorities for developing revised nitrate and/or salinity objectives
- Assess the range of alternatives for further consideration
- Identify technical tasks essential to the development effort

## AGENDA

- 1) **Welcome and Introductions** - Chair
    - a) Committee Roll call and [Membership Roster](#) -5 min.
    - b) Review/Approve Executive Committee [Meeting Notes for October 20, 2011](#) – 5 min.
  - 2) **Review Expected Outcomes for Nov. 17, 2011 Session** – Tim Moore – 5 min.
  - 3) **CV-SALTS Executive Committee Policy Discussions and Decisions** – 15 min
    - a) Review and discuss document
  - 3) **Discussion of Nitrate Objectives** – 30 min.
    - a) MUN standard (10 mg/L nitrate-nitrogen)
    - b) AGR standard, Livestock standard
    - c) Proposed Nutrient Control Policy
    - d) Implementation Elements for the SNMP
  - 4) **Discussion of Salinity Objectives for MUN** – 90 min.
    - a) Human Health Concerns
    - b) Other Domestic Use Concerns (non-drinking water)
    - c) Aesthetic Concerns
    - d) Identify Technical Tasks
- 11:30 am to 1:00 pm - Lunch on your own**
- 5) **Discussion of Salinity Objectives for AGR** – 90 min.
    - a) Technical Basis for Current EC Targets
    - b) Technical Concerns with Current EC Targets
    - c) Alternative Approaches
    - d) Identify Technical Tasks
  - 6) **Future Items**
    - a) Set next meeting date and objectives (December 15, 2011?)
    - b) Set next Administrative Conference Call date

**CV-SALTS Committee Rosters**

Executive Committee Membership			CV-SALTS Executive Committee Meetings During 2011																			
Voters	Category/Stakeholder Group	Name	20-Jan	10-Feb	17-Mar	12-Apr	22-Apr	12-May	24-May	16-Jun	23-Jun	21-Jul	9-Aug	13-Sep	15-Sep	19-Oct	20-Oct	15-Nov	17-Nov	15-Dec		
<b>Leadership Partners</b>																						
1	Central Valley Water Board	Pamela Creedon		✓	✓		✓	✓		✓		✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓				
Alt	Central Valley Water Board	Jeanne Chilcott		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓				
2	State Water Resources Control Bd.	Darrin Polhemus	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓		✓		✓										
3	Department of Water Resources	Jose Faria	✓																			
Alt	Department of Water Resources	Ernie Taylor	✓		✓	✓		✓			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓				✓			
4	US Bureau of Reclamation	Jobaid Kabir	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓		✓	✓	✓	✓							
5	Environmental Justice	TBD																				
6	Environmental Water Quality	TBD																				
<b>CV Salinity Coalition</b>																						
1	CASA	Bobbi Larson			✓	✓	✓			✓							✓					
2	County of San Joaquin	Mel Lytle										✓										
Alt	County of San Joaquin	Brandon Nakagawa										✓										
3	CVCWA	Debbie Webster	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓				✓			
4	City of Fresno	Steve Hogg	✓																			
5	CA League of Food Processors	Trudi Hughes		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			✓			
Alt	CA League of Food Processors	Rob Neenan				✓	✓	✓			✓	✓			✓							
6	Wine Institute	Tim Schmelzer	✓	✓				✓	✓	✓						✓	✓					
Alt	Wine Institute	Chris Savage										✓							✓			
7	City of Tracy	Steve Bailey	✓																			
8	Sacramento Regional CSD	Linda Dorn	✓	✓	✓								✓	✓		✓	✓	✓				
9	San Joaquin River Group	Dennis Westcot	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓						✓		
10	City of Modesto	Gary DeJesus	✓			✓	✓	✓			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓				✓		
11	California Rice Commission	Tim Johnson				✓	✓	✓		✓		✓			✓		✓					
12	City of Manteca	Phil Govea																				
13	Tulare Lake Drainage/Storage District	Mike Nordstrom	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			✓		
Alt	Tulare Lake Drainage/Storage District	Doug Davis																				
14	Stockton East Water District	Karna Harrigfeld	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			
15	Western Plant Health Association	Renee Pinel	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			
16	City of Vacaville	Royce Cunningham	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		
<b>Comm. Chairs/Co-chairs</b>																						
1	Chair Executive Committee	Parry Klassen		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		
2	Vice Chair Executive Committee	Jeff Willett	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			
*	Technical Advisory Committee	Robert Tassey										✓			✓	✓	✓					
3	Technical Advisory Committee	Nigel Quinn, LBL	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			
4	Public Education and Outreach	Joe DiGiorgio	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	
5	Economic and Social Cost Committee	David Cory		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		

\* = Already votes as Leadership or Coalition member

**Participants also identified for 10/20:**

- ✓ Pam Buford, CVRWQCB
- ✓ Karl Longley, CSU Fresno
- ✓ Michael Steiger, EKI
- ✓ Andy Safford, EKI
- ✓ Jean-Pierre, J.P., Cativiela, Dairy
- ✓ Jim Martin, CVRWQCB

**Past Participants:**

- |                                 |  |  |
|---------------------------------|--|--|
| Tom Griffith, Envirotech        | Stephen McCord, LWA                    | Cindy Paulson, CUWA                            |
| John Herrick                    | Erica DeHollan, LA C                   | Geoff Anderson, DWR                            |
| Katy Walsh                      | Andy Malone, Wildermuth Env.           | Dan Odenweller, RWQCB                          |
| Mark Gowdy, SWRCB, Water Rights | Chad Dibble, CDFG                      | Danny Merkely, California Farm Bureau          |
| Betty Yee, RWQCB                | David Miller, GEI Consultants          | Emily Alejandrino/Jim Martin, CVRWQCB          |
| Claus Suverkropp, LWA           | Gary Carlton, Kennedy Jenks            | Emily Robidart Rooney, Ag Council              |
| Tom Grovhoug, LWA               | Jamil Ibrahim, MWH Global              | Gail Cismowski, CVRWQCB                        |
| Paul Martin, W.U.D.             | Jay Simi, CVRWQCB                      | Jenny Skrel, Ironhouse Sanitary District       |
| Rik Rasmussen, SWRCB            | Jodi Pontureri, SWRCB                  | Erick Althorp SSIWQC                           |
| Jennifer Clary, CWA             | Mark Larsen, Kaweah Delta WCD          | Mark Dorman, Rainsoft Water PWQA               |
| Tess Dunham, Somach             | Lou Dambrosio, TWG                     | Mark Felton, Culligan Water and PWQA           |
|                                 | Bruce Houdesheldt, NCWA/Sac Valley WQC | Fern Wilson, City of Vacaville                 |
|                                 | Stan Dean, SRCSD                       | Rick Staggs, City of Fresno                    |
|                                 | Melanie Thomson, CUWA                  | Robert Chrobak and Stuart Childs Kennedy/Jenks |
|                                 | Gene Lee, Reclamation                  | Ron Crites, Brown and Caldwell                 |
|                                 |  | Lou Regenmorte, CDM                            |

# CV-SALTS Executive Committee Meeting

October 20, 2011 9:00 AM to 2:30 PM

Sacramento Regional Sanitation District Offices – Sunset Maple Room

**Attendees are listed on the Membership Roster**

## **AGENDA**

### 1) Welcome and Introductions Chair

- Meeting was brought to order by Chair Parry Klassen, and roll call was completed.
- Paul Martin moved to approve, and Nigel Quinn seconded, and by general acclamation the September 15, 2011 meeting action notes were approved.

### 2) Review Expected Outcomes for October 20, 2011 Session

- The morning session began with a discussion led by Rik Rasmussen on work being done at the state level on nutrient numeric endpoint protocols. Policy development is in the beginning stages. Three Beneficial Use Risk Categories (1,2, &3) were developed 5 years ago. They currently have a contract with US EPA to go forward on 5 case studies, with an estimated time for completion of approximately 18 months. Parry Klassen requested that the Executive Committee receive periodic updates on the status of this project.
- Tim Moore reviewed expected outcomes for the session: Finalize selection of “obvious and uncontroversial” examples of waterbodies for designation, classification and sub-classification of the MUN use; the level of effort to necessary to accomplish that; and determination of affordability. The committee will move to the consideration of objectives with the November 17<sup>th</sup> policy session.

### 3) Review and Discuss Scopes for Previously Identified Archetypes

- Michael Steiger and Andy Safford reviewed for the committee the background work completed on the previously nominated waterbodies and communities of:
  - Live Oak
  - Biggs
  - Willows
  - Butte Slough
  - Colusa
  - Tulare Lake Bed
  - Communities of: Hillmar, Ripon, and Lemon Cove
- Butte Slough was withdrawn due to lack of MUN designation.
- Two summary tables were presented to the committee for decision-making purposes, outlining proposed generalized tasks and potential cost ranges per task. Based on the cost estimates the committee felt it was necessary to prioritize the selected waterbodies of Live Oak, Biggs, and Willows.
- To avoid false starts and costly revisions, and yield a more cost effective process, Tom Grovhoug recommended an early strategic evaluation of the potential consequences of the dedesignations, followed by a meeting among key regulatory agencies.
- Jeanne Chilcott advised the committee that there had been a reallocation of staff resources at the last Regional Board Meeting, and there were now 4 personnel assigned to CV-SALTS efforts.

4) Summarize additional Nominated Waterbodies for MUN and AGR

- No additional waterbodies were nominated.

5) Discuss and Approve Archetypical Examples for MUN and AGR

- The PM session began with Michael Steiger reviewing ideas generated for opportunities for CV-SALTS involvement in the communities of Lemon Cove, Hillmar, Seville and Ripon. Pamela Creedon reminded the committee that nothing could be presented to the board called a Salt and Nitrate Management Plan that did not have an approach to address communities that are polluted. Daniel Cozad will draft a framework that addresses both the short term and long term solutions needed to address these issues in the management plan.
- It was generally agreed that the committee could provide certain technical assistance for grant applications in these disadvantaged communities. Tim Moore reiterated that they became successful in Santa Ana when they tied the planning process to the grant application process.
- After a discussion on the Tulare Lake Bed it was decided that Richard Meyerhoff would work with Regional Board Staff and Tulare Lake Drainage District in development of that work plan and formulation of policy issues.
- To facilitate prioritization of the surface water archetypes, a subcommittee was formed consisting of: Debbie Webster, David Cory, Tess Dunham, Tom Grovhoug and Roberta Tassey.
- Tim Moore closed the meeting with a preliminary discussion on objectives. He referred back to the morning's opening discussion on nutrient standards, and indicated he thought it was almost pointless to spend any time on nitrate objectives. As a result he asked the committee's permission to set aside nitrate objectives and focus next on salinity.

*CV-SALTS meetings are held in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act set forth in Government Code sections 11120-11132 (§ 11121(d)). The public is entitled to have access to the records of the body which are posted at <http://www.cvsalinity.org>*

# CV-SALTS Executive Committee

## Policy Discussions and Decisions

---

On October 20, 2011 the Executive Committee met to review and discuss the concepts and alternatives. Based on these discussions, several decisions were made and the consultants were given additional direction to guide future planning efforts. The purpose of this memorandum is to document these decisions in order to facilitate timely development of the CV-SALTS deliverables. There is broad agreement among members of the Executive Committee on the following:

- 1) There is a need and an obligation to develop a Salt and Nitrate Management Plan (SNMP) to protect the beneficial use of surface and ground waters throughout the Central Valley region.
- 2) Development of an overarching valley wide CV-SNMP representing the Central Valley which will integrate regional or local SNMPS as they are developed by entities including IRWM groups.
- 3) Development of an effective CV-SNMP presumes that appropriate beneficial uses have been assigned to each water body.
- 4) In some cases, the MUN use that is presumed to apply to all surface and ground waters in the region may not be appropriate and more fitting uses should be designated.
- 5) Rather than attempt to identify and remedy each instance where the presumptive MUN use may not apply, it is more cost-effective to develop a semi-standardized procedure based on a few select cases to serve as "proof-of-concept" archetypes for the CV region.
- 6) The archetypical examples should be selected based on the following criteria: (a) regulatory urgency - pending NPDES permit actions depend on accurate use designation; (b) regulatory simplicity - the example meets one or more of the state's exemption criteria; (c) regulatory utility - the facts in each case are widely applicable to similar situations elsewhere in the region; (d) regulatory cost - existing data and documentation minimizes the expected cost to make the necessary demonstrations.
- 7) Based on the aforementioned criteria, the Executive Committee suggests that the following cases (and related receiving waters) should be considered for use as "proof-of-concept" archetypes: (a) Live Oak, (b) Willows, (c) Colusa, and (d) Biggs.

- 8) Regional Board staff are already preparing a proposed work plan for one or more of the water bodies identified above. The Executive Committee appointed a subcommittee to work with Water Board staff to help develop appropriate technical elements for these work plans and recommend areas for collaboration and leveraging. The subcommittee was asked to streamline the process by applying the previous lessons learned from recent experiences in Old Alamo Creek and in Sulfur Creek. Members of the subcommittee include: Debbie Webster, David Cory, Tess Dunham, Tom Grovhoug, Roberta Tassej and others who may wish to serve.
- 9) The findings and results of these technical studies and any regional SNMPs completed, will be used to support appropriate basin plan amendments and will be incorporated into the CV-SNMP. In addition, the process and procedures described in the work plans will serve as a template to guide similar studies in the future.
- 10) The Executive Committee also recommends that the aquifer underlying the historic Tulare Lake bed serve as the archetypical example for evaluating the appropriateness of a MUN designation based solely on naturally-elevated TDS concentrations in a ground water basin. The Tulare Lake Drainage District (TLDD) has completed extensive prior studies of the area. CV-SALTS will work closely with TLDD and the Regional Board staff to determine what additional information may be required to qualify this aquifer for an exception to the state Sources of Drinking Water Policy (88-63).
- 11) Just as there are water bodies previously presumed to be MUN that may be incapable of serving that beneficial use, there are also water bodies where the MUN use is already occurring but where existing water quality is not protecting that use. This is particularly true in small rural communities where nitrate concentrations exceed safe drinking water standards. Therefore, an effective CV-SNMP must provide both near-term and long-term strategies to address this problem.
- 12) To demonstrate the credibility and effectiveness of the collaborative process, CV-SALTS is committed to early implementation efforts for the CV-SNMP. CV-SALTS will work with the Regional Board and various NGOs to identify economically-disadvantaged communities where excess nitrate levels severely impair the local drinking water supply. CV-SALTS proposes to provide technical/engineering expertise and grant-writing assistance to accelerate project design and implementation. In addition, CV-SALTS will review the current system of regulatory incentives and impediments to recommend critical change opportunities as part of the CV-SNMP.
- 13) The Executive Committee has tasked EKI, with assistance from CDM, to develop more detailed Scopes-of-Work (including schedule and budget estimates) to execute the tasks described above. Some of these anticipated efforts, such as those related to developing surface water archetypes for evaluating the MUN designation, would be funded jointly through state grant funds and matching contributions from the Salinity Coalition, its

members and other grants and funding sources. Other tasks, principally those focused on providing technical assistance to economically-disadvantaged communities will be supported by members of the Salinity Coalition and would not be funded by Cleanup and Abatement Funds.

- 14) Once accepted, the Executive Committee will work with Regional Board staff to solicit qualified contractors to provide the services defined in the detailed Scopes-of-Work. The goal is to begin these efforts in early 2012 and complete them by the end of that same year.
- 15) In a parallel effort, timed to coincide with the tasks described above, the Technical Committee and the Knowledge-Gained Subcommittee are developing a Conceptual Model and Approach for the valley wide CV-SNMP. A contract Scope-of-Work is forthcoming.

# CV-SALTS Annual Meeting Calendar

# 2011

JANUARY						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
					1	2
3	4	5	6	7	8	9
10	11	12	13	14	15	16
17	18	19	20	21	22	23
24	25	26	27	28	29	30
31						

Sac Regional

FEBRUARY						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28						

Sac Regional

MARCH						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30	31			

Sac Regional

APRIL						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
				1	2	3
4	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29	30	

Sac Regional

MAY						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
						1
2	3	4	5	6	7	8
9	10	11	12	13	14	15
16	17	18	19	20	21	22
23	24	25	26	27	28	29
30	31					

Sac Regional

JUNE						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
		1	2	3	4	5
6	7	8	9	10	11	12
13	14	15	16	17	18	19
20	21	22	23	24	25	26
27	28	29	30			

Sac Regional

JULY						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
				1	2	3
4	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29	30	31

Sac Regional

AUGUST						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8	9	10	11	12	13	14
15	16	17	18	19	20	21
22	23	24	25	26	27	28
29	30	31				

Sac Regional

SEPTEMBER						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
			1	2	3	4
5	6	7	8	9	10	11
12	13	14	15	16	17	18
19	20	21	22	23	24	25
26	27	28	29	30		

ACWA Downtown

OCTOBER						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
					1	2
3	4	5	6	7	8	9
10	11	12	13	14	15	16
17	18	19	20	21	22	23
24	25	26	27	28	29	30
31						

Sac Regional

NOVEMBER						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30				

Sac Regional

DECEMBER						
MON	TUE	WED	THU	FRI	SAT	SUN
			1	2	3	4
5	6	7	8	9	10	11
12	13	14	15	16	17	18
19	20	21	22	23	24	25
26	27	28	29	30	31	

Cal EPA?

**SALTY 5 Coordination Meetings**

1/3/11: Salty 5 January
2/7/11: Salty 5 February
3/7/11: Salty 5
4/4/11: Salty 5
5/2/11: Salty 5
6/6/11: Salty 5
7/11/11: Salty 5
8/1/11: Salty 5
9/12/11: Salty 5
10/3/11: Salty 5
11/7/11: Salty 5
12/5/11: Salty 5

**CV-SALTS Committee Meetings**

2/24/11 Salinity Leadership Group
1/20/11 Committees Meetings
2/10/11 Committees Meetings
3/17/11 Committees Meetings
4/12/11 Committees Meetings
4/22/11 Committees Meetings
5/12/11 Committees Meetings
5/24/11 Committees Meetings
6/16/11 Committees Meetings
6/23/11 Committees Meetings
7/21/11 Committees Meetings
8/9/11 Committees Meetings
8/18/11 Committees Meetings
9/13/11 Committees Meetings
9/15/11 Committees Meetings
10/19/11 Committees Meetings
10/20/11 Committees Meetings
11/15/11 Committees Meetings
11/17/11 Committees Meetings
12/12/11 Committees Meetings
12/15/11 Committees Meetings
1/11/11 LSJR Committee

**Potential Conflicting Meetings**

6/7/11 State Board Meeting
6/8/11 Regional Board Meeting
6/8/11 State Board Meeting
6/9/11 Regional Board Meeting
6/10/11 Regional Board Meeting
6/21/11 State Board Meeting
6/22/11 State Board Meeting
7/5/11 State Board Meeting
7/6/11 State Board Meeting
7/19/11 State Board Meeting
7/20/11 State Board Meeting
8/2/11 State Board Meeting
8/3/11 Regional Board Meeting
8/3/11 State Board Meeting
8/4/11 Regional Board Meeting
8/5/11 Regional Board Meeting
8/16/11 State Board Meeting
8/17/11 State Board Meeting
9/6/11 State Board Meeting
9/7/11 State Board Meeting
9/20/11 State Board Meeting
9/21/11 State Board Meeting